

Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group
MINUTES

MMWTWG-04-2022
Thursday, September 8, 2022, 7:00 p.m.
Via Zoom

Members Present: Mark Davis - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie
Doug Bell - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie
Bill Palmer - Citizen - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie
Steve Adams - Municipality of Brockton
Alex Westerhout - Municipality of Central Huron
Scott Mackey - Township of Chatsworth
Paul McQueen - Municipality of Grey Highlands
Tom Allwood - Municipality of Grey Highlands
Stewart Halliday - Citizen - Municipality of Grey Highlands
Randy Roppel - Municipality of Kincardine
Margaret Mercer - Township of Melancthon
Mike Hentz - Municipality of Dutton Dunwich
Bill Neilson - Township of Melancthon

Others Present: Julie Hamilton - Recording Secretary
Warren Howard
Vern Martin

1. Zoom Meeting Details

2. Call to Order

The Chair called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm. A quorum was present.

3. Adoption of Agenda

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-29

Moved by: Scott Mackey - Township of Chatsworth

Seconded by: Bill Neilson - Township of Melancthon

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby adopts the agenda of the Thursday, September 8, 2022 as distributed by the Recording Secretary.

Carried

4. Disclosures of Pecuniary Interest and General Nature Thereof

None.

5. Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 June 9, 2022 MMWTWG Minutes

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-30

Moved by: Mike Hentz - Municipality
of Dutton Dunwich

Seconded by: Bill Palmer - Citizen -
Municipality of Arran-
Elderslie

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves the minutes of the Thursday, June 9, 2022 meeting as presented by the Recording Secretary.

Carried

6. Business Arising from the Minutes

**6.1 MECP Response Letter to the MMWTWG February 25, 2022
Re: Ontario's Energy Plan and Wind Turbines**

The letter was in response to the Working Group's letter sent to the Ministry to address concerns around compliance and the acoustic audit requirements for wind facilities. The letter notes that the requirement to conduct an acoustic audit is included as a condition in most wind facility Renewable Energy Approvals (REAs) and conducted at wind facilities to indicate whether it meets the ministry's noise limits. The ministry requires acoustic audits to be conducted in accordance with the requirements outlined in the current Compliance Protocol for Wind Turbine Noise (Compliance Protocol).

The Chair opened the floor for comments on the response letter.

There are a number of projects that do not appear to be posting the audit reports to their website. The current compliance rate is 47% and 37% of projects are currently under review. There are a number of projects found to be incomplete and non-compliant but there has been no response from those projects back to the Ministry. The Working Group discussed what measures could be taken to become compliant.

The criteria used to measure noise does not cover some of the concerns the working group has raised, so when people are complaining about noise outside of the accepted criteria, it may not be acknowledged by the Ministry.

The Group noted that it was positive that a response was received but the letter indicates that the Ministry responds to all complaints received however, the Working Groups has had several letters go unanswered. A suggestion was made to request quarterly report outlining the complaints received and the response that could assist with better understanding residents concerns.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-31

Moved by: Steve Adams - Municipality
of Brockton

Seconded by: Alex Westerhout -
Municipality of Central
Huron

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby,

1. Receives agenda item, 5.1 MECP Response Letter to the MMWTWG February 25, 2022 Re: Ontario's Energy Plan and Wind Turbines, for information.
2. Directs that a response letter be provided to the Ministry requesting quarterly reports regarding complaints with respect to industrial wind turbine projects.

Carried

7. Delegations/Presentations

7.1 Verbal Update on Items of Interest to the the MMWTWG - Warren Howard

Mr. Howard provided an update on items of interest to the Working Group.

Independent Electrical System Operator (IESO)

The IESO is very active on a number of initiatives.

There are four winners of the medium-term contract. Four gas companies, Melancthon I and Convergent which is a battery storage facility in Sue Ste Marie.

The long-term RFP has announced qualified applicants and there are 15 wind companies included. The actual RFP will be in 2023.

Pumped storage projects appear to have active focus on projects in Meaford, Marmora and Schreiber.

Melancthon I – Five Year Contract Offered

Wind Concerns Ontario responded with letter to Minister of Energy noting a number of points on why the project should not proceed. It is the worst wind project in Ontario for resident complaints. Some of the points addressed in the letter include:

- Ministry field assessment – wind turbines are tonal and cyclic – 35 dBA standard applies
- Ministry directive to field – wind turbines cannot be tonal or cyclic
- Project remodeled – 2006 assessment underestimated wind shear
- 25% of wind turbines located too close to non-participating receptors
- Maximum power reductions implemented to reach 40 dBA standard
- Current noise protocol requires consideration of tonal quality – must be non-compliant
- No consultation with municipality or community

Saugeen Hydrogen Plant

A proposal to use surplus electricity to create hydrogen was presented to Ashfield Colborne Wawanosh for municipal support. Council supported the project. During the process, there was no

community engagement or location for plant proposed. The rumour is that it may be adjacent to existing transformer station which is located on top of sensitive ground water recharge area.

Brookfield Storage Facility – SS Marie

The company owns Price I & II wind projects is building a storage facility. The proposal presented to Councils for support and support received. The contracts deal with the purchase of power from the projects but no details on the storage of the power. The details are rather vague at this time and a letter will be drafted to the minister questioning the particulars of the project and contracts.

Discussions with Minister of Energy Todd Smith

Discussion on the following were with Todd Smith were initiated by an activist from Todd's Smith's riding of Bay of Quinte.

- SMR (Small Nuclear) capabilities is being moved forward to 2028
- Any procurement must have municipal support
- Minister Smith sees limited role for wind turbines
- Updating setback rules for wind turbines should be achievable

The Working Group discussed the contract award of the Melancthon I project. The contract has been offered and is to be accepted by the end of September. Members from Melancthon Township raised concerns that they have around the process of the contract award and the lack of consultation with the municipality and residents. It was noted that more details around the projects can be found on the IESO website.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-32

Moved by: Steve Adams - Municipality of Brockton

Seconded by: Mike Hentz - Municipality of Dutton Dunwich

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby receives the verbal updates made by Mr. Howard for information purposes.

Carried

8. Correspondence

8.1 Requiring Action

8.1.1 Approval of Recording Secretary Invoice

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-33

Moved by: Scott Mackey - Township of Chatsworth

Seconded by: Doug Bell - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves the Recording Secretary invoice for June, July and August for payment.

Carried

8.2 For Information

8.2.1 Wind Concerns Ontario - RFP Feedback

The document provides the feedback from Wind Concerns Ontario (WCO) on the IESO's proposals for the Long-Term RFP to procure additional electrical generation capacity.

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-34

Moved by: Mark Davis - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Seconded by: Mike Hentz - Municipality of Dutton Dunwich

Be It resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby accepts the correspondence 7.2.1 Wind Concerns Ontario RFP Feedback, for information purposes.

Carried

8.2.2 Statement of Financial Position as of August 31 2022

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-35

Moved by: Scott Mackey - Township of Chatsworth

Seconded by: Doug Bell - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby receives the statement of financial position as of August 31, 2022 for information purposes.

Carried

9. Members Updates

There is a paper being developed that provides a measure that can be used to predict citizen annoyance. The study has included citizen annoyance cases related to wind turbines projects including the Enbridge project and K2 as well as areas outside of wind turbine areas to show that the measure is effective in determining whether citizen annoyance relating to wind turbines exists. The paper has not been yet been published.

A citizen has asked whether the MMWTWG would return to the in-person method of meeting. At this time the meetings will remain by Zoom and the meeting platform can be revisited in the future by the Members.

The government in Newfoundland has removed the moratorium recently and the province is erecting 180 offshore wind turbines and developing technology to produce green hydrogen. There could be increased pressure to get the negative side of wind turbines out to the public.

The Working Group discussed the varying role that AMO has played regarding the position of the MMWTWG over the years with respect to wind turbines. AMO has recently reached out to the group and in the past, has not necessarily wanted to be involved with the group. AMO has been provided with Chair Allwood's contact details and he has offered to meet with them to discuss the position that the MMWTWG

continues to hold. AMO has also connected the City of Ottawa with the Working Group. New interest has arisen from the City of Ottawa to potentially become Members of the Working Group. The Terms of Reference for the Working Group and meeting details have been provided.

10. New Business

10.1 Letter to Minister of Finance Re: Taxation on IWT Projects

Under Section 42.5 of Ontario Regulation 282/98, the current assessed value for each turbine for the years 2017 to 2023 is fixed at \$50,460 multiplied by the installed capacity in megawatts of the generator attached to the wind turbine tower. This value is well short of the replacement value of the structure. The letter requests a review of the tax assessment rate assigned to wind turbines by a regulation under the authority of the Minister of Finance. The current assessment value does not reflect the impact of the wind turbines on the municipal costs.

Also of note, the new MP for Bruce Grey Owen Sound is the Parliamentary Assistant to the Minister of Finance and this could be a good topic for him to bring forward.

The Working Group also discussed the building permit fees associated with wind turbines. There is the potential to write these into your fee bylaw. Inclusion would be subject to a public review process and there is a one-year period for complaints to be received. There is the potential that IWT companies may challenge the fee structure.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-36

Moved by: Randy Roppel -
Municipality of Kincardine

Seconded by: Paul McQueen -
Municipality of Grey
Highlands

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves the letter as presented for distribution once the table details for the member municipalities with wind turbines has been finalized.

10.2 Municipal Support Resolution Letter

The letter addresses concerns that the current proposals on the process to consider municipal support for energy projects does not reflect statements that were thought to reflect government policy. It was the understanding of the Working Group that the PC government was committed to providing municipalities with the power to prevent the siting of these projects in their communities without the consent of the municipality. However, in the IESO presentation on August 10th, it indicates that rating criteria will provide proposals with municipal support resolutions with additional points during the scoring process indicating that the municipal support is not a mandatory requirement.

The letter notes a project in Dutton Dunwich where a contract was awarded because of 50% participation from an Indigenous community in located in northwestern Ontario that had no relationship to the community, which increased the score despite municipal opposition. It also notes that the local Indigenous community was opposed to the project.

The Working Group believes that the IESO process should include:

- Restrictions and rules related to renewable energy projects adopted by municipalities as zoning bylaws must be respected and cannot be overridden in IESO decision making by other criteria.
- The Municipal Support Resolutions must be a mandatory requirement to be awarded by the IESO that cannot be overridden by other rated criteria.
- Indigenous community support will only apply to projects located within their traditional territories, not elsewhere in the province

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-37

Moved by: Bill Palmer - Citizen -
Municipality of Arran-
Elderslie

Seconded by: Steve Adams - Municipality
of Brockton

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working
Group hereby approves the letter for distribution as amended.

Carried

11. Closed Session (if required)

There was Closed Session during this meeting.

12. Resolution to Reconvene in Open Session

13. Adoption of Recommendations Arising from Closed Session (If Any)

14. Adoption of Closed Session Minutes

15. Confirmation of Next Meeting

The next meeting will be held on November 10, 2022.

16. Adjournment

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-38

Moved by: Paul McQueen -
Municipality of Grey
Highlands

Seconded by: Mark Davis - Municipality
of Arran-Elderslie

Be it Resolved that the meeting of the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine
Working Group is hereby adjourned at 8:43 p.m.

Carried

Tom Allwood, Chair

Julie Hamilton,
Recording Secretary